



Nevada Site Specific Advisory Board

April 19, 2017

Mr. Robert Boehlecke
Environmental Management Operations Manager
U.S. Department of Energy, EM Nevada Program
P. O. Box 98518
Las Vegas, NV 89193-8518

SUBJECT: Nevada Site Specific Advisory Board (NSSAB)
Recommendation for Internal Peer Review Process
Improvement — Work Plan Item #6

Dear Mr. Boehlecke:

The NSSAB was asked to provide recommendations, from a community perspective, to the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE) on ways to enhance the Underground Test Area (UGTA) internal peer review process.

At the January 18th Full Board meeting, Bill Wilborn, UGTA Activity Lead, provided a briefing on the internal peer review process in support of this work plan item. Three NSSAB subcommittees were formed to observe the internal peer review process for Rainier Mesa/Shoshone Mountain (RM/SM), Yucca Flat/Climax Mine, and the Pahute Mesa corrective action units.

On March 28, 2017, Members Richard Twiddy, William Sears, and Edward Rosemark attended the RM/SM Internal Peer Review meeting for the GoldSim Model. At the April 19th Full Board meeting, this NSSAB subcommittee provided a written and oral update to the Board on their observations of the RM/SM Internal Peer Review.

Based on the updates by the NSSAB subcommittee for the RM/SM Internal Peer Review for the GoldSim Model and Board discussion, the NSSAB recommends that DOE incorporate the recommendations included in the enclosed written update with the understanding that this recommendation may be modified based on observations of subsequent internal peer review conducted during FY 2017 for Yucca Flat/Climax Mine, Pahute Mesa, and RM/SM Flow and Transport Modeling Report.

The NSSAB appreciates the opportunity to observe the RM/SM Internal Peer Review for the GoldSim Model and to provide this recommendation and extends a special thanks to the UGTA Science Advisors and the RM/SM Internal Peer Review committee.

Sincerely,

Steven Rosenbaum, Chair

Members

Amina Anderson
Michael Anderson
Arcadio Bolanos
Frank Bonesteel (Vice-Chair)
Michael D'Alessio
Karen Eastman
Pennie Edmond
Raymond Elgin
Charles Fullen
Richard Gardner
Donald Neill
Autumn Pietras
Edward Rosemark
Steve Rosenbaum (Chair)
William Sears
Cecilia Flores Snyder
Richard Stephans
Jack Sypolt
Richard Twiddy
Dina Williamson-Erdag

Liaisons

Clark County
Consolidated Group of Tribes
and Organizations
Esmeralda County Commission
Nye County Commission
Nye County Emergency
Management
Nye County Nuclear Waste
Repository Project Office
State of Nevada Division of
Environmental Protection
U.S. National Park Service
White Pine County Commission

Administration

Barbara Ulmer, Administrator
Navarro
Kelly Snyder, DDFO
*U.S. Department of Energy,
Nevada Field Office*

NSSAB Subcommittee Overview of Internal Peer Review Meeting

PER Review of Rainer Mesa/Shoshone Mountain Interim Results of “Top Down” Streamline-Based Models using GoldSim

Meeting conducted 3/28/2017

Attendees: 9 committee members, (1 committee member was sick, not present),
11 interested parties, 3 from NSSAB (Overview)

Overview and conclusions:

The meeting was conducted in accordance with Agenda and Schedule. There was open discussion, with a multitude of questions and responses. At no time were there any extraneous activities. It was apparent that the subject matter presented was clear, understandable, and defensible. The Modelers and Presenters know their data. The meeting objectives were met. In conclusion, there are two recommendations and several observations.

Recommendations:

Overall, the NSSAB attendees were impressed with the professionalism and details provided by the meeting attendees. However, we recommend the following,

1. The presenters should be set up with voice enhancement system. It may even be helpful to include the committee members.
2. The chair (Mavrik Zavarin) should appoint someone from the committee to facilitate the meeting. The various breaks usually went too long and could have been reduced with some individual guidance. However, it should be noted that the meeting ended within the time-frame allowed with all business completed.

Observations:

The NSSAB members were tasked with observing the meeting process and not become involved with the technical aspects of the meeting. After the meeting, however, the three NSSAB members had some observations that may be helpful in the planning for the External PER review. They are:

1. The presentation materials, along with a list of final expectations should be sent to the external reviewers, in advance.
2. The presentation material should include a page of definitions.
3. The package of materials, if sent to the external reviewers, should include a list of expectations.
4. The presentation slides should be boiled down to a few essential, while keeping the details limited and available.

Three members from the NSSAB: Richard Twiddy, Bill Sears, and Ed Rosemark attended the meeting to evaluate the meeting efficiency with the goal of providing any suggestions or comments that could enhance any future meeting of a similar nature. In preparation, a detailed worksheet was developed and used to evaluate the various aspects of the meeting and its attendees.

It was a very open meeting and quite clear, early in the meeting, that the chair was very interested in comments, suggestions, or questions regarding the subject matter from anyone who had an interest. There was never an incident whereby any individual question was censured or rejected for any reason. There was opportunity and plenty of open discussion. It appeared that all questions were adequately addressed and answered to most everyone's satisfaction. One of the biggest agreement from technical aspect was an agreement on terms, i.e. "conservative", "assume", "plausible". When to use and when not to use.

In the end the meeting did serve its purpose. There was achievement of the stated goals and objectives as well as future schedule of activities to complete the task.

cc: D. A. Borak, DOE/HQ (EM-3.2)
M. R. Hudson, DOE/HQ (EM-3.2)
B. K. Ulmer, Navarro
NSSAB Members and Liaisons
C. E. Hampton, NFO
K. K. Snyder, NFO
W. R. Wilborn, NFO
NFO Read File